

Carla Compagno

Missionary Intent in Ramon Llull's Proposals at the Council of Vienne*

Introduction

Before I speak about the part that Ramon Llull played at the council in Vienne, I wish to briefly present to you who is he.

It's difficult to explain and to define in a few words the literary, theological, and philosophical production of this author, whose interests ranged from theology to natural philosophy, cosmology, medicine, and law. A complete and recent presentation of Ramon Llull, of his whole production and thought, is offered by the second *Supplementum Lullianum*, edited by Brepols in the year 2008, with the title: *Raimundus Lullus, An Introduction to his Life, Works and Thought*.¹ The primary sources and documents about Llull's life are: the autobiographical book *Vita coetanea*,² the biographical book *Electorium paruum seu Breuiculum*,³ which was written by Thomas Le Myésier – one of Llull's disciples, and other various documents edited by J. N. Hillgarth in the year 2001 with the title *Diplomatari*.⁴ Other documents are published in the appendix to the book *El Miramar de Ramon Llull* (1977)⁵ by S. García Palou.

The Catalan philosopher and theologian Ramon Llull, born in Mallorca in the year 1232, spent his life building a logical system to demonstrate the Truth; according to Llull the only Truth is the Christian creed with its mysteries and dogmas.

* This essay presents the talk, that I held on 16 April 2012 for the Séminaire de Recherche IEM with the title *Le concile de Vienne 1311-2011* at the L'Institut Catholique de Paris. It delineates the role of Ramon Llull at the council of Vienne with particular attention to the primary and secondary literature about this topic.

¹ *Raimundus Lullus. An Introduction to his Life, Works and Thought*, Edited by A. FIDORA-J. E. RUBIO, ROL - Supplementum Lullianum II, Brepols Publishers, Turnhout 2008, pp. 564.

² RAIMUNDUS LULLUS, *Vita coetanea*, ROL VIII (1980), ed. H. Harada, pp. 259-309.

³ THOMAS LE MYÉSIER, *Breuiculum seu Electorium paruum Thomae Migerii*, ROL – Supplementi Lulliani Tomus I, ed. C. Lohr, T. Pindl-Büchel, G. Stamm, Turnholti 1990.

⁴ J. N. HILLGARTH, *Diplomatari lul·là: documents relatius a Ramon Llull i a la seva família*, Barcelona-Palma de Mallorca 2001.

⁵ S. GARCÍA PALOU, *El Miramar de Ramon Llull*, Palma de Mallorca 1977, pp. 317-342.

The Lullian *Ars* is founded on general constant principles, or *rationes necessariae*, acceptable to the three monotheistic religions: Christianity, Judaism, and Islam. These principles should reflect all that exists, from God and his qualities to all creatures and the relation between them. Through the correspondence of letters and these general constant principles and their combination, Llull obtains true sentences about God and creatures, and about dogmas and articles of Faith. The Lullian combinatory syntax is represented both through the use of letters and geometrical figures, such as the circle, the square, and the triangle. Moreover, it operates according to the rules of the mathematical combination theory.⁶

The key to this rational logic system derives, however, from God. In fact, in the *Vita coetanea* the author reports: «The Lord suddenly illuminated his mind, giving him the form and method [of] the aforementioned book against the errors of the unbelievers»;⁷ the book Llull is alluding to here is to become his *Ars compendiosa inueniendi ueritatem* (1274). After this illumination by the grace of God, Ramon converted to Christianity and, moreover, left his wife and family to dedicate himself first to the contemplative life and then to the task of converting the infidels. In other words, demonstrating the truth of Christianity to the unbelievers became the aim of his whole life, and, in this sense, the Lullian *Ars* constitutes the intellectual method the religious dialogue must be based on.

The codex Karlsruhe, Badische Landesbibliothek, St. Peter perg. (Vellum) 92 contains the *Breuiiculum* by Thomas Le Myésier, which is the author of the miniatures that present the most important events in Llull's life. In the picture of folium 4r we can see Ramon Llull receiving the illumination from God. In the middle, Thomas Le Myésier speaks with his teacher Ramon Llull; and on the right, Llull explains the Christian truths to the people.

Ramon Llull at the council of Vienne

Now I wish to turn to the main focus of my presentation, Ramon Llull at the Council of Vienne.

In August⁸ 1308 Pope Clement V calls for a council in Vienne on November 1st, 1310, with the bull *Regnans in coelis*, but it doesn't take place. Later, with the

⁶ J. E. RUBIO, *Thought: the Art*, in *Raimundus Lullus. An Introduction...*, cit., pp. 243-309.

⁷ English translation mentioned in *Raimundus Lullus. An Introduction...*, cit., p. 45 and taken from *Selected Works of Ramon Llull*, ed. A. Bonner, 2 voll., Princeton 1985, vol. I, p. 22 [= SW]. RAIMUNDUS LULLUS, *Vita coetanea*, cit., p. 280: «Post haec Raimundus ascendit in montem quendam, qui non longe distabat a domo sua, causa Deum ibidem tranquillius contemplandi. In quo, cum iam stetisset non plene per octo dies, accidit quadam die, dum ipse staret ibi caelos attente respiciens, quod subito Dominus illustravit mentem suam, dans eidem formam et modum faciendi librum, de quo supra dicitur, contra errores infidelium. De quo Raimundus immensas gratias reddens Altissimo, descendit de monte illo. Reuersusque mox ad abbatiam supra dictam, coepit ibidem ordinare et facere librum illum, uocans ipsum primo: Artem maiorem, sed postea: Artem generalem».

⁸ Precisely on 12th August.

bull *Alma Mater* (on April 4th, 1310) the Pope convenes the Council of Vienne on October 1st, 1311.

The council begins precisely on October 16th, 1311.

The Pope wishes to speak about three main questions:⁹

1. The Knights Templar.
2. The reconquest of the Holy Land.
3. Church reform.

As written in the *Vita coetanea*,¹⁰ Ramon Llull is planning to take part in the council.

Some months before drafting the *Liber de ente quod simpliciter*, which Llull wishes to officially present to the council, he writes the *Liber natalis pueri paruuli Christi Jesu*¹¹ (in January 1311) during his third sojourn to Paris and dedicates it to King Philip IV of France. This Lullian work tells of the epiphany of the *puer* (Jesus Christus) and of the Virgin Mary to six ladies. These are Praise (*Laus*), Prayer (*Oratio*), Love (*Caritas*), Remorse (*Contritio*), Confession (*Confessio*), and Satisfaction (*Satisfactio*). In the fourth chapter of the book after the criticism of the averroism,¹² Llull stresses¹³ the importance of the foundation of language schools and, in particular, of chairs of language at the university in Paris¹⁴ and «alibi» (in other plac-

⁹ C. J. HEFELE, *Histoire des Conciles*, par Dom. H. Leclercq, Tome VI, Paris 1915, p. 645.

¹⁰ RAIMUNDUS LULLUS, *Vita coetanea*, cit., pp. 302-303: «Post haec autem sciens Raimundus, fore a sanctissimo patre, domino Clemente papa quinto, generale concilium celebrandum apud ciuitatem Viennensem, anno Domini 1311 in Kalendis Octobris, proposuit ire ad dictum concilium, ut tria ibidem impetraret ad reparationem fidei orthodoxae. Primum quidem, ut locus constitueretur sufficiens, in quo uiri deuoti et intellectu uigentes ponerentur, studentes in diuersis linguarum generibus, quod omni creaturae scirent doctrinam euangelicam praedicare. Secundum uero, ut de cunctis religiosis militibus christianis fieret unus ordo; qui ultra mare contra Saracenos usque ad recuperationem Terrae sanctae bella continua, retinerent. Tertium autem, ut contra opiniones Auerrois, qui in multis peruersor extitit ueritatis, dominus papa celeriter ordinaret remedium, quod per uiros intelligentes catholicos, non intendentes ad sui gloriam, sed Christi honorem, obiceretur praedictis opinionibus et eas tenentibus, quae obuiare uidentur ueritati et sapientiae increatae, Filio Dei Patris. Et de his compilauit Raimundus quendam libellum, qui intitulatur Liber Natalis, promittens insuper habere rationes cogentes, tam philosophicas quam theologicas, contra eos. Quas quidem clarissime pertractauit in aliquibus librorum suorum. Fecit enim iste famulus Dei, summae ueritatis et profundissimae trinitatis uerus expressor, inter cotidianos labores suos centum et uiginti et tres libros, et plures».

¹¹ ID., *Liber natalis pueri paruuli Christi Jesu*, ROL VII (1975), ed. H. Harada, pp. 19-73.

¹² *Ivi*, p. 69: «[...] cum ipse sit pugil ecclesiae et defensor fidei Christianae, libros et dicta Auerrois expelleret et extrahi faceret de Parisiensi studio, taliter quod nullus de cetero auderet allegare, legere uel audire; quia multos errores turpissimos continent contra fidem, et, quod est deterius et periculosius, dictos errores frequenter generant in pluribus et diuersis. Et est turpe et dedecus dicere christianis, quod fides magis est improbabilis, quam probabilis uel apparens; quod dicunt et asserunt Auerroim haereticum imitantes».

¹³ Llull probably knew already about the council at this time.

¹⁴ RAIMUNDUS LULLUS, *Liber natalis pueri paruuli...*, cit., p. 70: «Et etiam, quod dominus rex, magnificus atque potens, cum papa et cardinalibus ordinaret, quod Parisius et alibi essent loca et

es). Furthermore, he affirms the necessity of the institution of a title in favour of the Church and the importance of unifying the military orders.¹⁵ King Philip the Fair appears here as the *defensor fidei*¹⁶ (*Fidei Defensor*), who can carry out all necessary things to convert the infidels, so that infidels and faithful people can become *one sheepfold with only one shepherd* («usquequo infidelis populus fideli populo uniretur, et esset unum ouile et unus pastor»).

In September 1311 Lull writes the aforementioned *Liber de ente, quod simpliciter est per se et propter se existens et agens*,¹⁷ in which he systematically explains all of the proposals he wishes to present to the council assembly. His suggestions are developed especially in the 6th part of the text, which in the handwritten tradition is sometimes transmitted separate from the rest of the book with the title *Petitio in concilio generali*. The main points of the *Liber natalis pueri* are all discussed here again, now more extensively and systematically.

At the beginning of the *Petitio* he writes that the infidelity of Jews and of Saracens, the errors of pagans and false philosophers, of schismatics and even of false Christians, has damaged the Christian Church, which is, consequently, wrongly

studia, in quibus diuersa lingua fidelium et infidelium docerentur, ut uiri deuoti, sapientes et litterati ad exaltationem fidei per mundum uniuersum euangelium praedicarent, et per Dei gratiam inuenirentur plurimi, qui uellent propter Christum martyres fieri, sicut apostoli et eorum discipuli uoluerunt. Et quod talis ordinatio sic firmaretur, quod duraret, *usquequo infidelis populus fideli populo uniretur, et esset unum ouile et unus pastor, sicut est prophetatum*; et omnes laudarent et cognoscendo diligenter istum puerum benedictum, quem modo negligunt, uituperant et ignorant».

¹⁵ *Ibid.*: «Ulterius dixerunt praedictae sex dominae, quod dominus rex Francorum cum affectu et desiderio dominum papam rogaret et requireret cardinales, quod de omnibus religiosis militibus fieret unus ordo, qui debellantes contra turpem populum infidelem acquirerent Terram sanctam; et quod ecclesia tribueret decimas et alia auxilia copiose. Nam contra talem Christi militiam, Saracenus populus nullatenus posset stare».

¹⁶ *Ivi*, pp. 70-71: «Et quia rex est defensor fidei, tenetur ad honorem pueri talem petitionem facere et attentus dictum negotium promouere. Et quod dominus papa et omnes cardinales sunt ad hoc specialiter obligati, quia praedicto puero subditi, super quo ecclesia catholica est fundata, ut per totum mundum puer Iesus uniuersaliter adoretur; et obstructa uia descensus ad inferos totus caelestis exercitus plenitudine iocundetur. [...] Et praecepit eis, quod irent ad regem Franciae et ei dicerent uerba illa, et quod praedictum negotium sanctum et arduum uiriliter et benigne cum tota sua regali potentia acceptaret, et ad istud negotium exequendum et promouendum Philippum, filium regis Maioricarum, clericum, consanguineum suum, induceret, qui est illustris, deuotus et humilis, paratus et bene dispositus, ut cum papa et cardinalibus suis tamen assensu et consilio habitis, sanctum praedictum negotium promoueret. Et ulterius Maria Virgo, mater pueri dixit eis, quod si rex Francorum hoc faciat et deuote suis uiribus exequatur, pro certo sciat, quod Filius meus eum iuuabit, custodiet et defendet; et ego eum rogabo et rogare non cessabo cum tota multitudine beatorum. [...] Beatae Mariae Virginis finito sermone, ei sex dominae promiserunt, quod ad dominum regem Francorum uenirent, et ei supra dicta exponerent, uel Raimundum mitterent, qui dicto regi omnia per ordinem explicaret. Et hoc facto praedictae sex dominae cum reuerentia et magno gaudio a benedicto puero et eius matre Virgine recesserunt [...]».

¹⁷ *Id.*, *Liber de ente, quod simpliciter est per se et propter se existens et agens*, ROL VIII (1980), ed. H. Harada, pp. 179-245.

known and no longer loved («quod ipsa non sit bene cognita neque dilecta»)¹⁸ For this reason he sees the council as a very important occasion for exalting the Christian faith by destroying these errors and infidelities. Therefore, Llull wants to present his book «in quo multa bona sunt ordinanda et facienda» (which means: *where there is a considerable number of good things that should be carried out and done*).

Ramon Llull's has ten proposals to make to the council assembly.

The first¹⁹ is the foundation of language schools in Rome, Paris, and Toledo. In these schools it would be necessary, first of all, for the students to have already studied theology and philosophy. Then they will learn the «linguas infidelium» (the infidels' languages) to convert the unfaithful people by discussing philosophical and theological truths. As I'm going to explain later, this specific proposal was one of the most important campaigns in all of Llull's writings.

Llull's second proposal²⁰ is for a unification of the military orders, which he believes to be necessary for the task of reconquering not only the Holy Land but also

¹⁸ *Ivi*, pp. 190-191: «Multa enim mala principia sunt orta contra sanctam fidem catholicam, quae impediunt, quod ipsa non sit bene cognita neque dilecta; ratione cuius sequitur magnum damnum et deuotio finis, quare mundus sit creatus. Quae mala principia sunt infidelitates Iudaeorum, Saracenorum, paganorum et errores falsorum philosophorum, et etiam schismaticorum, falsorum christianorum. Et quia Concilium generale est mandatum apud Viennensem ciuitatem per dominum papam Clementem quintum et per reuerendos cardinales. Et spero, quod ipsum Concilium sit factum per Deum et propter Deum, ut sancta fides catholica sit exaltata, et errores, qui sunt contra ipsam, sint destructi; aliter Concilium esset in derisione et extra finem deductum; quod esset ualde magnum damnum et a Deo ingratum; et illi, qui hoc facerent, poenas infernales expectarent; quod absit. Vnde propter hoc intendimus praesentare istum librum illis Concilium generale facientibus, ut simus excusati in die iudicii per ipsum librum praesentatum, in quo multa bona sunt ordinanda et facienda». Llull repeats his will to present his book at the council in the introduction of his suggestions, *Ivi*, p. 239: «De sexta et ultima distinctione [Ordinationes decem quas Raimundus intendit praesentare in Concilio generali] Distinctio ista in decem partes est diuisa. Quae sunt de aliquibus generalibus ordinationibus, quas Raimundus proponit praesentare in Concilio generali, eo quia in ipsis ordinationibus implicatur generalis exaltatio sanctae fidei catholicae et bonus status totius uniuersi».

¹⁹ *Ivi*, pp. 239-240: «De prima ordinatione. Prima ordinatio est, quod dominus papa et reuerendi domini cardinales faciant tria loca, unum Romae, aliud Parisius et tertium in Tholeta ciuitate, in quibus addiscant sapientes, bene scientes philosophiam et theologiam, linguas infidelium. Et quod sint deuoti, ut moriantur propter Christum per exaltationem fidei. Et quod uadant praedicare euangelia per uniuersum mundum, ut in euangelio praeceptum est [cfr. Marc. 16, 15; Matth. 28, 18-20]. Et in illis locis sint tales homines in perpetuum addiscentes, quia quando unus bene fundatus mittetur ad praedicandum, ponatur alius. Tales homines autem conuerterent totum mundum, et hoc Deo adiuuante, et hoc etiam, quia ipsi facerent hoc, quod eis competeret, et ueram scientiam seminarent, bonum exemplum darent, et modus apostolorum et martyrum reuerteretur; et credo, quod pro ipsis Deus magna miracula ostenderet. Talis autem ordinatio tam bona, tam magna etc. ad primam, secundam et tertiam distinctionem applicatur. Et qui ipsam ordinationem facere potest, et non facit sed impedit, credo, quod poenae infernales ipsum exspectant».

²⁰ *Ivi*, p. 240: «De secunda ordinatione. Decens est, quod dominus papa et reuerendi domini cardinales ordinent, quod omnes milites religiosi uniantur in uno ordine. Et quod una pars eat ad acquirendum Constantinopolim, quia per hoc posset successiue acquiri Turquia et dare passagium per terram ad Terram sanctam. Et alia pars eat ad Hispaniam ad acquirendum quandam ciuitatem, quae uocatur Septa, quae est in Barbaria; ipsa acquisita posset acquiri regnum Marochi et etiam tota Barbaria. Et quod utraque pars militum teneat totum mare cum galeis contra Saracenos; et hoc in

the Spanish regions occupied by the Saracens. A part of this new unified military order should at first undertake to conquer Turkey, whose acquisition could make a transit to Holy Land («passagium per terram ad Terram sanctam») possible. Another part of the order should recover the Spanish city of Ceuta (*Septa*) and her port in Morocco. In order to accomplish this, the Christian soldiers' galleys should occupy the sea and fight against the Saracens.

The 3rd proposal also deals with²¹ the question of the reconquest of the Holy Land. Lull thinks that the setting up of a tithe can fund the church's missions: all Christian sovereigns must pay this tithe to the church, or otherwise they will be excommunicated. Since the Saracens prevent Christianity from taking hold in the whole world, the reconquering of the regions that they occupy must become the main aim of Christianity and of its sovereigns.

Lull's 4th proposal²² involves a regulation of the ecclesiastical prebends. He argues that the prelates should take only one prebend and give the other ones to the mission of the Church. If one prelate dies, the Church will inherit all of his properties, not the sovereigns. The purpose is clearly to fund the Christian mission. The

perpetuum, usque quo Saraceni omnino essent acquisiti. Ad talem ordinationem tam bonam, tam magnam etc. multi milites saeculares et etiam pedites uenirent cum expensis suis et instarent; et hoc quia desiderarent mori propter Christum. Contra talem ordinationem tam bonam, tam magnam, tam durabilem, quis esset Saracenus, qui durare posset? Certe nullus. Qui habet aures audiat [cfr. Marc. 4, 9]. Et qui talem ordinationem impedit, in consilio diaboli consistit. Quod autem illud, quod ego dico, sit possibile, per primam, secundam et tertiam distinctionem manifestum est».

²¹ *Ivi*, pp. 240-241: «De tertia ordinatione. Dicitur, quod omne agens agit propter finem. Deus est agens; ergo agit propter finem. Hoc pro tanto dico, quia Deus pro nihilo non fecit beatum Petrum uicarium nec dedit imperium Romanum ecclesiae, nec multiplicauit tot clericos atque diuitias eorum; immo fecit ad suum honorem; ut patet in secunda distinctione, per hoc quia Deus agit per se et propter se extrinsece, et hoc quia bonum, magnum etc. est. Hoc pro tanto dico, quod detur decima ecclesiae omnino ad acquirendum Terram sanctam, et etiam totam terram, quam tenent Saraceni; quia Saraceni impediunt maxime quod non sit christianitas per totum mundum. Si autem dicatur, quod decima ecclesiae dari non potest, quia principes christianorum hoc impedirent, ad hoc posset esse remedium, quia si principes hoc facerent, excommunicentur in Curia et etiam tota terra eorum; et sic excommunicatione durante populi sustinere non possent, neque per consequens principes. Faciat autem ecclesia hoc, quod sibi competit, quia Deus semper agit propter finem. Ex quo sequitur, quod clerici non sint arietes neque principes leones. Qui habet aures, audiat [cfr. Marc. 4, 9], quia maximum negotium cum maximo timore et auaritia impetrari non potest, immo cum magna audacia et largitate».

²² *Ivi*, pp. 241-242: «De quarta ordinatione. Per primam, secundam et tertiam distinctionem patet, quod deuiatio finis et otiositas sunt timendae. Hoc pro tanto dico, quod multi clerici habent plures praebendas. Et ideo bonum, magnum et uerum esset, quod dominus papa et reuerendi domini cardinales ordinarent cum praelatis, quod nullus clericus habeat nisi unam praebendam; et praebendae, quas haberet praeter unam darentur ad passagium, dum uiueret; et etiam quod praelatus habeat certos scutiferos et equitaturas, et hoc temperate ad euitandum uanam gloriam et etiam malum exemplum, et quod praelato mortuo uasa argentea et etiam omnia iocalia, uestes et alia sua dentur ad passagium. Et si ordo Templariorum destrueretur, quod bona illius ordinis dentur ordini militum religiosorum praedictorum, ut habeant maiorem potestatem contra Saracenos; non quod bona Templariorum dentur principibus, nec clericis, cum satis habeant et sint diuites; etiam quod est de eleemosyna multiplicatum, ad seruitium Terrae sanctae debet dari. Et qui contra hoc est, in morte iram Dei et maledictionem expectat».

same measure should be carried out if the Order of the Temple is destroyed: all Templars' properties must be inherited from the new unified order to support its military actions for the reconquest of the Holy Land.

Clerical clothing is the object of the 5th proposal:²³ As sobriety is sign of humility, it is important to pay close attention to the clergy's clothing in order to prevent vanity and hypocrisy from spreading among the clerical orders.

The debate between theology and philosophy is dealt by Llull in his 6th point:²⁴ It's necessary to avoid reading philosophers whose thought is against the Christian religion. The only true philosophy that can be made compatible with the truths of the Christian faith is natural philosophy. Doctor Colomba is going to speak about this point, and therefore I will not go into it in detail in this presentation.

After this point, Llull declares himself to be against usury:²⁵ Christian usurers must be excommunicated. This proposal is connected clearly both with point number five about the hypocrisy of some clerics and point number three about the institution of a tithe in favour of the Church.

Llull proposes a new program of preaching for Jews and Muslims²⁶ in the 8th point: in many Christian regions, Jews and Muslims live under the control of the

²³ *Ivi*, p. 242: «De Quinta ordinatione. Per primam, secundam et tertiam distinctionem patet, quod bonum, magnum etc. est, quod differentia existat inter habitum clericalem et saecularem; et hoc simpliciter, non mixtim. Hoc pro tanto dico, quod clericus nullo modo induat pannum rubeum neque uiridem; et quod tonsura sit a parte ante et a parte post rotunda sicut est superius rotunda; et quod nullus laicus portet tonsuram. Et dico, quod bonum, magnum etc. esset, quod cappa clericorum sit proportionata quoad longitudinem, et etiam capucium, ut non sit perditio pannorum et uana gloria et in aliquibus hypocrisia. Et qui contra hoc est, ordinatus non est».

²⁴ *Ivi*, pp. 242-243: «De sexta ordinatione. Ordinum est, quod intellectus faciat scientiam, primo cum sensu et imaginatione, et hoc de rebus corporalibus et imaginabilibus; post ascendit ad obiecta spiritualia, sicut ad Deum, ad angelos, ad animas racionales obiective; et faciat scientiam cum ipsis et de ipsis, quae imaginabiles neque sensibiles non sunt. Et ideo aliqui philosophi credunt philosophice improbare sanctam fidem catholicam, quae sensibilis et imaginabilis non est; et ideo patitur fides. Et passio multiplicatur, quia multi christiani dubitant ipsam esse ueram, eo quia antiqui philosophi dixerunt multa contra fidem. Hoc pro tanto dico, quia bonum esset, quod dominus papa et reuerendi domini cardinales et praelati ordinarent, quod nulla philosophia legeretur contra theologiam, sed legeretur philosophia naturalis, quae concordaretur cum theologia. Quae philosophia esset uera et necessaria, ipsa existente ordinata et constituta ex principiis primitiuis, ueris et necessariis, in prima, secunda et tertia distinctione significatis; et cum tali uero philosophia omnes falsae philosophiae destrui possunt. Qui autem talem ordinationem facere potest, et ipsam impedit, ipse est contra finem, ratione cuius Deus agit. Et talis autem non potest Deum decipere neque cogere, neque a suis manibus euadere in die iudicii Qui habet aures, audiat [cfr. Marc. 4, 9]; et qui non habet, conscientiam habeat».

²⁵ *Ivi*, p. 243: «De septima ordinatione. Usura mala est, et maxime in christianis. Ex quo sequitur, quod bonum esset, quod dominus papa et reuerendi domini cardinales et etiam praelati ordinarent, quod christianus usurarius non posset facere testamentum, neque sacramento eius crederetur, et quod sit omnino excommunicatus. Per talem ordinationem plures animae uenirent ad paradysum, quae uadunt ad infernum; et multi, qui sunt usurarii, essent ueri mercatores, et non falsi. Qui contra istam ordinationem instaret, sub diuina bonitate, magnitudine etc. moraliter non esset creatus».

²⁶ *Ivi*, pp. 243-244: «De octaua ordinatione. Multi Iudaei et etiam Saraceni sunt subditi christianis, et maxime in Hispania. Et ideo bonum, magnum et uerum est, quod Iudaeis praedicetur in

Christians. For this reason it is important for them to preach on different days, for example the Muslims on Friday and the Jews on Saturday. It's also necessary for the Christians to discuss and debate with them about the truths of the faith by means of syllogisms in order to lead them to the path of truth.

In the 9th and 10th points, Llull proposes a reform of law and medical studies.²⁷ Both of these sciences should be based on their innate and intelligible principles, so that their cognitive structure can be turned into syllogisms. Only in this way is it possible to investigate the truths of these particular sciences and to put their theoretical principles into practice.

At the end²⁸ of the book Llull asks the council to realize his proposals, because they are *good* («*sunt bona*») and important for the Christian people. According to Llull's thought, the council must be a good example for the whole of Christianity, and only by carrying out all of these suggestions can it really demonstrate this. On

die sabbati, et Saracenis in die ueneris, quia in illis diebus est festum eorum; et quod sermones reducantur ad syllogismum et ad intelligibile, secundum quod patet in prima, secunda et tertia distinctione. Et si talis praedicatio sit perpetua, necessario sequeretur quod tales Iudaei et Saraceni uenirent ad uiam ueritatis, quia intellectus magis se delectat et se impraegnat per intelligere, quam per credere. Ad talem praedicationem autem unum librum feci; et etiam in pluribus, quos feci, est implicata. Qui autem contra talem ordinationem est, habeat aures et audiat uerbum Dei, dicentis [cfr. Matth. 12, 30]: Qui non est mecum, contra me est».

²⁷ *Ivi*, pp. 244-245: «De nona ordinatione. Bonum, magnum etc. est, quod scientia iuris reducatur ad syllogismos, quia confusa est et prolixa. Et hoc fieri potest per illum modum, quem fecimus in uno libro, qui uocatur *Ars iuris*, reducendo ipsam ad principia innata primitiua, uera et necessaria, ut in prima, secunda et tertia distinctione significatum est. Quia nullum ius uere est ius, nisi uere et simpliciter sit bonum, magnum et durabile etc. Facta autem tali ordinatione seu scientia, addiscatur per aliquos iuristas. Et quod sint iudices generales in ciuitatibus in certo numero, secundum quod ciuitas est; et quod sint conducti a principibus et a praelatis, ut non accipiant salarium, ut euitetur magnus labor eorum, qui litigant in scientia iuris, et etiam perditio temporis, pecuniae, et huiusmodi. Qui contra talem ordinationem est, uere iustus non est. De decima et ultima ordinatione. Scientia medicinae ualde est absconsa. Ex quo sequitur, quod medici citius falluntur in suis experimentis, quam non. Ratio huius est, quia maxime stant ad auctoritates medicorum antiquorum, et non ad intelligibile. Et ideo bonum esset, quod dominus papa et reuerendi domini cardinales ordinarent, quod fieret una ars medicinae, constituta ex principiis innatis, sicut ego feci unam; quoniam principia innata constituunt caelum, elementa, motum et omnia illa, quibus medicus indiget ad curandum infirmum et ad cognoscendum suam infirmitatem. Per hoc autem bonum, magnum etc. sequi posset, ut patet in prima, secunda et tertia distinctione. Qui autem contra talem ordinationem esset, contra suam sanitatem esset; et possibile est, quod Deus dicat ei in die iudicii [cfr. Matth. 25, 12]: Nescio uos, ut in euangelio exemplificatum est».

²⁸ *Ivi*, p. 245: «Multa autem alia bona in concilio generali ordinari possunt. Et si fiant, bonum est; et si praedicta, quae diximus, non fiant, maximum malum est. Concilium autem in dimittendo magna bona, et in faciendo parua, deridetur et negligetur; quod magnum malum exemplum erit; et melius esset, quod concilium non fuisset. Sed ea, quae dicta sunt in libro quoad ordinationem concilii, sunt bona et facienda, et etiam possibilis, quod per primam, secundam et tertiam distinctionem significatum est. Et ideo supplico quantum possum, quod dominus papa, reuerendi domini cardinales, praelati, principes et barones et communitates ciuitatum recipiant ipsum humiliter et benigne, quia de bona intentione factus est; et quod sit iudicatus et tractatus talis, qualis ipse est. Ad laudem et honorem Dei finiuit Raimundus Parisius istum librum mense Septembris anno 1311 incarnationis Domini nostri Iesu Christi. Amen».

the other hand, Llull presents his book with humility, which he emphasizes having written with good intentions («*bona intentione*»), to the Pope, cardinals, prelates, sovereigns, and barons, so that they can judge it.

These are all of the suggestions Llull makes in the *Liber de ente*.

In the same year Llull wrote many other books. Besides the Catalan poem *Del concili*,²⁹ he also wrote the work *Disputatio Petri clerici et Raimundi phantastici*³⁰ in October.

This *Disputatio* is a dialogue between Ramon, a layman, and Peter, a cleric. The topic of their discussion is the Council of Vienne. Whereas Peter is going to take part in the council in order to obtain benefices for himself and his family, Ramon's only real interest is the unity of Christianity and the conversion of unbelievers. As a result, Ramon considers Peter's attitude a moral perversion, and on the other hand, Peter thinks that Ramon is «phantasticus», meaning mad.³¹

Ramon is going to present three proposals to the assembly; they agree with some of the points that were dealt in the *Liber de ente*:

1. The first is the foundation of language schools, without mention of their location.³²
2. The second is the unification of military orders under a religious order.³³
3. The third the fight against the errors of Averroism.³⁴

The dialogue doesn't have a real conclusion, because Ramon and Peter don't exchange opinions on the subject.³⁵

²⁹ ID., *Del concili*, ORL XX (1938), ed. S. Galmés, pp. 253-288.

³⁰ ID., *Disputatio Petri clerici et Raimundi phantastici*, ROL XVI (1988), ed. A. Oliver - M. Senellart - F. Domínguez, pp. 1-30; p. 30: «Ad gloriam et honorem Dei finitus est praesens liber a Raimundo anno 1311 incarnationis Domini nostri Iesu Christi». There is also a French translation from the XVII century edited and translated by M. SENELLART: *Le fantastique, ou la dispute de Pierre le clerc et de Raymond le fantastique (1311)*, trad. M. Senellart; pres. J. Greisch, in *Penser la religion. Recherches en philosophie de la religion*, (Philosophie) Paris 1991, pp. 17-52.

³¹ RAIMUNDUS LULLUS, *Disputatio Petri clerici...*, cit., p. 14: «Accidit duos homines, ad generale Concilium euntes, sibi inuicem obuiasse, quorum unus erat clericus et alter erat laicus. Clericus uero nomen suum a laico petiit; respondit laicus: Raimundus Lullus. Ait clericus: Raimunde, diu de te audiui, quod magnus sis phantasticus. Age, dic mihi, quid in hoc generale Concilium aduenis impetraturus».

³² *Ibid.*: «Ait Raimundus: Tria intendo. Primum: Vt dominus papa et reuerendi cardinales studia, in quibus uaria discantur idiomata, statuere uelint, ut postmodum auditores, per omnia mundi climata proficiscentes, sancta Dei euangelia, sicut praeceptum est, praedicent, ut que talis ordinatio eousque, dum omnes infideles ad christianorum ritum peruenerint, perduret».

³³ *Ibid.*: «Secundum: Vt dominus papa et reuerendi cardinales unum constituent generalem ordinem, omnes religiosos continentem milites, qui omnes ultra mare maneant, quousque Terra sancta christianis fuerit restituta, illic impugnantibus infideles».

³⁴ *Ibid.*: «Tertium: Vt papa suique cardinales uelint ordinare Auerrois errores Parisii seminatos penitus extirpari, cum per eos plurima mala nostra sanctissima patiat fides».

Council decisions and bulls

In the year 1312 the council assembly approved great historical measures through the issue of several bulls. The most important of them concerned the Knights Templar.³⁶ In fact, the bull *Vox in excelso* (Marz 1312) dissolved the Order of the Temple. In addition, the bull *Ad prouidam* (May 1312) ordered for the properties of the Knights Templar to be turned over to the Order of Hospitallers. The decree *Inter sollicitudines*³⁷ (May 1312) moreover, approved the foundation of language schools

³⁵ *Ivi*, pp. 14-15: «Mox uero clericus, ut haec uerba audiuit, risum profudit uehementer. Credebam, inquit, Raimunde, te phantasticum esse. Modo uero per haec tua uerba cognosco te non modo phantasticum, sed esse phantasticissimum. Ait Raimundus: Fortasse; uerum meas non percipio phantasias. Nam ea, quae dixi, et possibilia sunt, et fieri debita sunt, et non minus fructuosa. Sed forsitan tu ipse phantasticus es, qui phantastice risum profundis neque ad mea uerba mentem inclinas. Deberes tamen, cum clericus sis, potius quam ego, qui sum laicus, mentem deuotionem que ad eiusmodi rem inclinare. Hic clericus Raimundo multa conuicia dixit minas que intulit. Raimundus de conuiciis minis que clerici perparum curauit et dixit clerico: Clerice, credis me phantasticum, ego uero te. Vis ergo inter nos quaestio uersetur, quisnam fuerit phantasticus, et uterque pro se, se que tuendo, suas adducat rationes, id que in generali Concilio terminetur? Ait clericus: Consentio. Tunc Raimundus: Sed antequam rationes faciamus, primum nos scire oportet, quid phantasia uocetur, et terminos principia que constituere, ad quae nostras rationes formando recurramus. Verumtamen priusquam terminos eligamus, bonum mihi uidetur alterum alteri, cur ipsum phantasticum putet, suum conceptum causam que incitantem explicare. Haec uerba praeiipiens, clericus: Mihi, ait, uel maxime placet. Rogo te ergo, incipias, inquit Raimundus». In his article *Raymundus Lullus und der Sprachenkanon des Konzils von Vienne (1312)*, in «Historisches Jahrbuch der Görres-Gesellschaft» 53 (1933), B. ALTANER assumes that Lull wanted to present this book at the Council of Vienne too.

³⁶ About this topic see A. MUSCO, *Presentazione*, a M. M. M. ROMANO, *Raimondo Lullo. Arte Breve*, Milano 2002, pp. 5-24.

³⁷ C. J. HEFELE, *Histoire des Conciles*, cit., p. 688: «Inter sollicitudines nostris humeris incumbentes, perpeti cura revolvimus ut errantes in viam veritatis inducere, ipsosque lucrifacere Deo sua nobis cooperante gratia valeamus, hoc est, quod profecto desideranter exquirimus, ad id nostrae mentis sedulo destinamus affectum ac circa illud diligenti studio et studiosa diligentia vigilamus. Non ambigimus autem, quin ad huiusmodi nostrum desiderium assequendum divinorum eloquiorum sit expositio congrua, ipsorumque fidelis praedicatio admodum opportuna. Sed nec ignoramus quin et haec promi noscantur inaniter vacuaque redire, si auribus linguam loquentis ignorantium proferantur. Ideoque illius, cuius vicem in terris, licet immeriti, gerimus, imitantes exemplum, qui ituros per universum mundum ad evangelizandum apostolos in omni linguarum genere fore voluit eruditos viris catholicis notitiam linguarum habentibus, quibus utuntur infideles praecipue, abundare sanctam affectamus Ecclesiam, qui infideles ipsos sciant et valeant sacris institutis instruere, chisticolarumque collegio per doctrinam christianae fidei ac susceptionem sacri baptismatis aggregare. Ut igitur peritia linguarum huiusmodi possit habiliter per instructionis efficaciam obtineri: hoc sacro approbante concilio scholas in subscriptarum linguarum generibus, ubicumque romanam curiam residere contigerit, nec non in Parisiensi et Oxoniensi, Bononiensi et Salmantino studiis providimus erigendas, statuente ut in quolibet locorum ipsorum, teneantur viri catholici, sufficientem habentes *Hebraicae, Arabicae et Chaldaee* linguarum notitiam, duo videlicet uniuscujusque linguae periti, qui scholas regant inibi, et libros de linguis ipsis in latinum fideliter transferentes, alios linguas ipsas sollicite doceant, earumque peritiam studiosa in illos instructione transfundant, ut instructi et edocti sufficienter in linguis huiusmodi fructum speratum possint Deo auctore producere, fidem propagaturi

in Paris, Oxford, Bologna, and Salamanca. According to the content of the bull, in each school the students were to learn Hebrew, Arabic, and Chaldean. The purpose of this council measure appears to have been evangelization.

As a result, Llull was able to express his pleasure with the council decisions. After the closing of the Council of Vienne on May 6th, 1312, Llull went to Montpellier and composed the book *De locutione angelorum*³⁸ (On angel's speech), which is dedicated to the King of Sicily Frederick III. In the prologue the author writes: «.Raimundus quamplurimum est gausus...», which means: *Raimundus is very happy*. Thanks to both decisions of the assembly, i.e., the unification of the military order and the foundation of language schools, he believes that the infidels will first be overcome, and then they will be converted.³⁹

Llull and the crusade

Now I wish to make some observations about the idea of a crusade in Llull's thought.

The proposals presented by Llull at the Council of Vienne reflect, in reality, a point of view that the author developed throughout his entire life.

At the beginning of his literary production, Llull objected to the use of weapons, for example in the *Llibre de contemplació* (1273-74), the *Llibre contra Anticrist* (1274), and in the *Blaquerna* (1276-83) as well. For example, in the *Llibre contra Anticrist* Llull affirms that «from the experience of the wars and battles that the Christian kings, princes and great barons, [as well as] knights and other men have waged against the Saracens, we can discover and understand that it is possible to

salubriter in ipsos populos infideles. Quibus equidem in romana curia legentibus per Sedem apostolicam, in studiis vero Parisiensi per regem Franciae, in Oxoniensi Angliae, Scotiae, Hiberniae ac Waliae, in Bononiensi per Italiae, in Salamantino per Hispaniae praelatos, monasteria, capitula, conventus, collegia exempta et non exempta, et ecclesiarum rectores in stipendiis competentibus et sumptibus volumus provideri, contributionis onere singulis iuxta facultatum exigentiam imponendo, privilegiis et exemptionibus quibuscumque contrariis nequaquam obstantibus, quibus tamen nolumus quoad alia praejudicium generari». The decree was published by Pope John XXII in the *Clementinae* in year 1317.

³⁸ RAIMUNDUS LULLUS, *De locutione angelorum*, ROL XVI (1988), ed. A. Oliver, M. Senellart, F. Domínguez, pp. 207-236.

³⁹ *Ivi*, p. 216: «Raimundus, iacens in lecto suo, uolens se condormire, considerauit super aliquibus, quae facta sunt in Concilio generali Vianae, et potissime supra duas petitiones, quas summo Pontifici ipse dedit et suo collegio. Videlicet quod studia fierent, in quibus linguae infidelium in perpetuum docerentur hominibus deuotis, in philosophia et theologia fundatis, habentibus deuotionem mori seu mortem pati pro Christo ad exaltationem fidei sacrosanctae, eundo euangelium praedicatum per mundum uniuersum, ostendendo ipsius fidei ueritatem tali modo, quod illa ueritas erit intelligibilis atque certa, et suum oppositum erit falsum. Secunda positio est, quod bona Templariorum, Hospitalis sancti Iohannis concederentur, ut fortitudo multiplicetur ad tenendum certos milites et galeas in perpetuum contra Saracenos. Et quia istae duae petitiones sunt concessae, Raimundus quamplurimum est gausus, ex eo quia cum praedicta ordinatione Saraceni facilliter capi poterunt et deuinci; et ipsis deuictis, conuertetur facilius totus mundus, nam ipsi sunt, qui impediunt uniuersum».

convert the world and to conquer the Holy Land of Outremer in a loftier and nobler manner than the one that the Christians have adopted against the unbelievers through wars and battles of a physical nature». ⁴⁰ Christ and the Apostles should be the only model to imitate in order to convert the infidels. Moreover, in chapter 112 of the second book of the *Llibre de contemplació*, he says that there are «many knights [...] who go to the Holy Land of Outremar in the belief that they can conquer it by force of arms and who, in the long run, all wear themselves out without achieving what they set out to do». ⁴¹

Later some historical circumstances led Llull to change his view.

«In April of 1289 the city of Tripoli (Syria) had fallen into the hands of the Egyptians, leaving the Latins imprisoned in Acre. [...] Acre was finally taken in May 1291, bringing an end to the Latin presence in Palestine. [...] The two events had a bearing upon Ramon Llull's plans», remarks Fernando Domínguez in the aforementioned *Introduction...* (p. 70). As a result, Llull went to Rome and wrote the *Liber de passagio*, presented to Pope Nicholas IV. ⁴² The *Liber de Passagio* (1292) consists of

⁴⁰ Translation from *Raimundus Lullus. An Introduction to his Life...*, cit., pp. 71-72. RAIMUNDUS LULLUS, *Liber contra Antichristum* (1274), ed. P. May Beattie (1995), p. 286: «Per experientiam impugnationum et preliorum que reges et principes et ceteri barones christiani in ultramarinis partibus gesserunt aduersus sarracenos, manifeste perpendi potest alium modum excellentiorem et nobiliorem esse ad sarracenorum acquisitionem et ad subiugationem ultramarine terre. Non enim est bellum sensuale per arma ferrea super bellum intellectuale per arma deuotionis et desiderii martirii, vincendo inimicos christiani fidei veritate. Est autem modus predicti belli sensualis ipse per quem sarraceni sectam suam multiplicauerunt et tartari et alii infideles gladiis ferreis homines occidunt, non autem vincunt eos armis fidei, spei, caritatis, iusticie, prudentie, fortitudinis, temperantie, veritatis et patientie». Text edited in NEORL 3, extract from p. 159: «Per speriencia de les guerres e de les batalles que·ls reys christians, princeps e grans barons, cavallers e altres homens han fetes contra·ls sarrayns, pot hom conexer e saber que per altra manera pus alta e pus noble es possibol cosa a convertir lo mon e a conquerre la Santa Terra d'oltramar que no es ceylla que·ls cristians han presa contra·ls infaels per querres e per batalles sensuales contra les intellectuals batalles, la qual manera es semblant a la primera segons que los sarrayns han començada e muntificada lur secta. E açó matex se segueix dels tartres e dels infaels, qui per armes de fe, sperança, caritat, justicia, prudencia, fortitudo, temprança, veritat e passiencia».

⁴¹ Translation from the *Raimundus Lullus. An Introduction to his Life...*, cit., p. 71. RAIMUNDUS LULLUS, *Liber contemplationis*, MOG IX, chapter 112 of the second book, p. 250: «Multos equites video ire ad sanctam Terram ultramarinam, et putare ipsam acquirere per vim armorum, et in fine omnes consumuntur, quin veniant ad id, quod putant: unde videtur mihi, quod acquisito illius sanctae Terrae non debeat fieri, nisi eodem modo, quo Tu et tui Apostoli eam acquisistis, scilicet amore et orationibus et effusione lacrymarum et sanguinis. Cum sanctum Sepulchrum et sancta Terra ultramarina, Domine, videatur debere acquiri per praedicationem melius, quam per vim armorum, progrediantur sancti equites religiosi, et muniant se signo Crucis, et impleant se gratia sancti Spiritus, et eant praedicare infidelibus veritatem tuae Passionis [...]». ID., *Llibre de contemplació*, ORL IV (1910), chapter 112 of the second book, pp. 58-59: «Molts cavallers veg que van en la sancta terra doutramar e cuyden aquella conquerre per forsa darmes. On, com ve a la fi tots si consumen sens que no venen a fi de so ques cuyden. On, par me, Sènyer, que lo conqueriment daquella sancta terra nos deja conquerir si no per la manera on la conquesés vos els vostres apòstols, qui la conquerís ab amor e ab oracions e ab escampament de lagremes e de sanc».

⁴² F. DOMÍNGUEZ, *El papa Nicolás IV, destinatario del Liber de passagio, y Ramon Llull*, in «SL» 22 (2004), pp. 3-15.

the *Tractatus de modo conuertendi infideles* and the letter of entreaty known as *Quomodo terra sancta recuperari potest*. In this writing Llull «discuss for the first time in detail the question of military tactics or, in other words, the use of force to confront unbelievers, an option which, in previous works, he had firmly rejected».⁴³ For example, at the beginning of the second part the author writes two paragraphs about «de modo bellandi per mare» (about the struggle by sea) and «de modo bellandi per terram» (about the struggle by land).

After this book Llull composed others treatises in which he speaks about the need of an armed crusade in addition to the mission. These writings are: *Petitio Raimundi pro conuersione infidelium ad Coelestinum V papam*⁴⁴ (1294), *Petitio Raimundi pro conuersione infidelium ad Bonifatium VIII papam* (1295), *Liber de fine*⁴⁵ [*ad Clementem V papam*] (1305), the *Liber de acquisitione terrae sanctae*⁴⁶ (1309), and *Liber de ente, quod simpliciter est per se et propter se existens et agens*, mentioned above, written for the Council of Vienne.

Quoting the words of F. Cardini in *Studi sulla storia e sull'idea di crociata*, F. Domínguez observes in the *Introduction* to the *Liber de passagio* edited in ROL XXVIII that it's an error to think of mission and crusade as two separate concepts in medieval Christianity and, consequently, in Llull's ideology. In this sense, the crusade reveals itself to be one of the most useful means for the work of converting, and it is accepted by different authors. For example, a famous reference about the use of weapons against the infidels is Thomas Aquinas' words in *Summa theologica* (II^a, II^{ae}, q. X, a. VIII): *Ut fidem non impediunt*.⁴⁷ Thomas believes that the crusade is justified if it is undertaken in such a way that the infidels can't be an impediment to the Christian faith. Similarly, Llull writes in the *Liber de ente* (p. 241) that the Saracens prevent Christianity from spreading throughout the whole world («quia saraceni maxime impediunt quod non sint christiani per totum mundum»).

Therefore, it seems a misinterpretation to explain the development of the idea of crusade in Llull's thought as a definitive intellectual change from an extreme pacifism to a full warmongering. However, in order to provide a correct interpretation of Llull's ideology, it's important not to consider the necessity of an armed crusade as

⁴³ Raimundus Lullus, *An Introduction...*, cit., p. 71.

⁴⁴ RAIMUNDUS LULLUS, *MOG II* (1722), pp. 174-175.

⁴⁵ ID., *Liber de fine*, ROL IX (1981), ed. A. Madre, pp. 233-291.

⁴⁶ ÉPHREM LONGPRÉ, *Le Liber de acquisitione Terrae Sanctae du bienheureux Raymond Lulle*, in «*Criterion*» 10 (1927), pp. 265-278; E. KAMAR, *Projet de Raymond Lull De acquisitione Terrae Sanctae. Introduction et édition critique du texte*, in «*Studia Orientalia Christiana Collectanea*» 6 (1961), pp. 103-131.

⁴⁷ THOMAS DE AQUINO, *Summa theologica*, II^a-II^{ae}, q. X, a. VIII: «Respondeo dicendum quod infidelium quidam sunt qui nunquam susceperunt fidem, sicut gentiles et Iudaei. Et tales nullo modo sunt ad fidem compellendi, ut ipsi credant: quia credere voluntatis est. Sunt tamen compellendi a fidelibus, si facultas adsit, ut fidem non impediunt vel blasphemias, vel malis persuasionibus, vel etiam apertis persecutionibus. Et propter hoc fideles Christi frequenter contra infideles bellum movent, non quidem ut eos ad credendum cogant (quia si etiam eos vicissent et captivos haberent, in eorum libertate relinquerent an credere vellent): sed propter hoc ut eos compellant ne fidem Christi impediunt».

the main topic of his writings but rather his incessant effort to launch a religious dialogue with the unbelievers and his conviction to have really found the intellectual key to demonstrating the truth of the Christian religion and the untruth of all other faiths. The historical events bring Lull not only to accept the armed crusade but also to suggest it: that's true. On the other hand, the project of an armed crusade doesn't exclude his intellectual conviction about the possibility of converting the infidels by means of other tools. Lull believes firmly in the words «one sheepfold with only one shepherd». And the shepherd on the highest step is Christ, to whose will the Pope, all kings, and princes must submit. For this reason, the peace between all Christian lands that disagree about important theological matters – for example the divine or human nature of Christ, the dogma of the trinity, etc. – appears clearly necessary to destroy any doubt and, consequently, any weakness first in the Christian believers and then in their interlocutors. Moreover, the conversion of the Tartars would avoid a possible political relationship between them and the Muslims, who in this case would become militarily stronger. In this regard he shows a stark understanding for political strategies. The Lullian writing *Liber de passagio* deals with all these points.

Treatises about the crusades and the missions in the Holy Land aren't an invention of Lull. Pope Gregory X had already encouraged the writing of such reports during the council in Lyon (1274). Authors who wrote them included Humbert of Romans, Gilbert of Tournai, Guillermo of Trípoli, and Bruno of Olmütz. After the fall of city of Acre, such treatises began to flourish again. Not only did Lull write his *Liber de passagio*; Fidenzio of Padova, Taddeo of Napoli and Galvano of Levanto also wrote books about the crusade in the Holy Land during this time.

In 1307, before the council in Vienne, the Frenchman Pierre Dubois, close collaborator of King Philip IV the Fair, wrote a *De recuperatione terrae sanctae*, too. Although his treatise is pervaded with a different political ideology, it has various points in common with Lull's writings: first of all the importance of the union of Christianity.⁴⁸ In fact, the Christians, Dubois affirms, not only fight among themselves but also don't agree about some basic truths of Christianity. To fight infidelity, it is therefore essential to keep the peace between them. Besides, Pierre Dubois stresses the importance of learning the infidel's languages, too.⁴⁹ Faithful interpreters

⁴⁸ P. DUBOIS, *De recuperatione terre sancte*, par Ch.-V. Langlois, Alphonse Picard, Paris 1891, p. 3: «Ad hoc quod tanta multitudo ducatur illuc et duret, oportebit principes catholicos concordés esse et inter se guerras non habere [...] Idcirco inter catholicos omnes, saltem ecclesie romane obediétes, pacem firmari taliter expedit quod una sit república, sic fortiter unita quod non dividatur».

⁴⁹ *Ivi*, p. 47: «Item presidentibus regno jerusalem expediret habere secretarios multos fideles, peritos, qui linguas Arabum, scripturas eorum, et alia mundi ydiomata cognoscerent». And *Ivi* p. 48: «Quomodo amovebit errores a cordibus eorum, nisi per aliquos interpretes prudentes, fideles, qui prius utriusque linguam intelligant, mutuas voluntates explicant, respondere tam rationabiliter sciant ad objecta barbarorum, quod eorum opiniones erroneas destruant; per *inconvincibiles rationes* eos moveant et attrahant ad veritatem professionis christiane». *Ivi*, p. 50: «Ex nunc assumantur juvenes in grammatica instructi, in quo juniores preferantur; si sint aliqui in logica instructi, tanto meliores;

should destroy the false opinions of the infidels and then lead them to the truth of the Christian profession by means of «inconvincibiles rationes»⁵⁰ or by means of irrefutable arguments. All these considerations remind us of Llull's view on the same arguments, not only in *Liber de Passagio* but also, for example, in the *Liber de acquisitione terrae sanctae*. Here he writes: «There was a Saracen who wanted to become Christian, but because of the Schismatics he didn't know if he had to become Greek or Jacobite or Nestorian or Catholic, et cetera».⁵¹ A mutual influence between Llull and Dubois can't be assumed here, but it should be noted that both were at the University of Paris in the years 1287 to 1289 and that they were probably acquainted with each other.⁵²

Despite the ideological differences between all of these authors, the leitmotif of their treatises is the aim of converting. But, in order to convert the unbelievers, according to Llull the Christianity must use different means in different times, and among these means the crusade.

Nevertheless, at the end of his life Llull's opinion seems to have changed again. In the work *Liber de participatione christianorum et saracenorum*,⁵³ written in July 1312 and dedicated to King Frederick III, Llull argues for a peaceful dialogue with Muslims. In other words, he appears to abandon the idea of an armed crusade. In the prologue he remembers the Council of Vienne, and then he makes an appeal to King Frederick: He and the King of Tunis should agree that «christiani bene litterati et lingua arabica habituati» (meaning: learned Christians that are skilful in Arabic) could go to Tunis in order to speak with Arabians about the Christian truths. Conversely, «saraceni bene litterati» (meaning: *learned Saracens*) should come in Sicily in order to dispute with wise Christians about their faith. Only in this way, according to Llull, will there be peace between Christians and Saracens.⁵⁴

quorum aliqui cito in articulis fidei, et sacramentis, Veteri et Novo Testamento instruantur; ut instructi, quam primum erunt apti, mittantur in dictam Terram propter curam animarum gerendam, ut ad sacerdotium promoveantur».

⁵⁰ We find this word in Thomas Le Myésier's *Electorium Paruum* too: *Breuculum seu Electorium Paruum*, ROL Supplementi Lulliani Tomus I (1990), ed. C. Lohr-T. Pindl-Bücher-W. Büchel, Pars Dispositiva, p. 91: «Pars altera sapientium determinat, quod sunt de essentia animae, quam ueritatem docet Ars *rationibus inconuincibilibus*, et ad tantum deducentibus, quod, si non sunt de essentia animae, non est Deus materialiter intelligibile, diligibile, nec aliquid perfectum, nec aliquid summum».

⁵¹ RAIMUNDUS LULLUS, *Le Liber de acquisitione Terrae Sanctae*, cit., p. 277: «Adhuc accidit quod quidam sarracenus esse uoluit christianus, sed propter schismaticos nesciebat utrum se facere graecum, iacobinum, aut nestorianum vel se faceret catholicum seu romanum».

⁵² E. MÜLLER, *Das Konzil von Vienne 1311-1312*, Münster in Westfalen 1934, p. 639: «[...] daß beide Männer schon in den Jahren 1287-1289 an der Pariser Universität freundschaftlich miteinander verehrten [...]».

⁵³ RAIMUNDUS LULLUS, *Liber de participatione christianorum et saracenorum*, ROL XVI (1988), ed. A. Oliver, M. Senellart, F. Domínguez, pp. 237-260.

⁵⁴ *Ivi*, p. 246: «Raimundus ueniens de Concilio generali, quod factum fuit in Vianensi ciuitate, considerauit ordinationes, quae factae sunt ibi. Inter quas una est, quod addiscantur diuersa lingua

Before I conclude this crucial issue, I think it's essential to clarify two other points.

Lull and the Knights Templar

First I would like to say a few words about Lull's opinion on the matter of the *Knights Templar*.

Lull's first reference to the Knights Templar is in the aforementioned book *Quomodo terra sancta recuperari potest* (1292).⁵⁵ What Lull proposes here is in fact not the destruction of the Knights Templar but the unification of five military orders. These orders are the Teutonic Knights, the Knights Templar, the Order of Santiago, the Order of Caltrava, and the Hospitaller.⁵⁶ Their union should lead to the birth of a new order with the name *Ordo de Spiritu Sanctu*, whose *magister* should be a «*magister in theologia*», and the faithful soldiers should speak different languages in order to spread the *Verbum Dei* around the whole world.

Later, in *Liber de acquisitione terrae sanctae*,⁵⁷ written in the year 1309 after the bull *Regnans in coelis*,⁵⁸ Lull speaks more specifically about the dissolution of

per christianos, qui uadant praedicatum per uniuersum mundum sanctissimum uerbum Dei et disputatum cum infidelibus ad ostendendum sanctam fidem catholicam et audiendum ea, cum quibus saraceni impugnant sanctam fidem catholicam, et concludant ea, quae sunt intelligibilia et possibilis apud Deum sine aliqua inconuenientia et impossibilitate. Secunda ordinatio uero est, quod Ordo beati Iohannis, cui dantur bona Templariorum, pugnet cum armis contra saracenos in perpetuum cum militibus et galeis perpetuis. Dum sic Raimundus considerabat, proposuit uenire ad nobilissimum uirtuosissimum dominum Fredericum, regem Trinacriae, ut ipse, cum sit fons deuotionis, ordinet cum altissimo et potentissimo rege Tunicii, quod christiani bene litterati et lingua arabica habituati uadant Tuniciam ad ostendendum ueritatem de fide, et quod saraceni bene litterati ueniant ad regnum Siciliae disputatum cum sapientibus christianis de fide eorum. Et forte per talem modum posset esse pax inter christianos et saracenos, habendo talem modum per uniuersum mundum, non quod christiani uadant ad destruendum saracenos, nec saraceni christianos. Et ideo Raimundus facit istum librum ad praesentandum nobilissimis regibus praelibatis».

⁵⁵ S. GARCÍA PALOU, *Ramón Llull y la abolición de los Templarios*, in «Hispania sacra» 26 (1973), pp. 123-136: p. 123.

⁵⁶ RAIMUNDUS LULLUS, *Quomodo terra sancta recuperari potest, tractatus de modo convertendi infideles*, in *Opera Latina beati Magistri Raimundi Lulli a magistris et professoribus edita Maioricensis Scholae Lullisticae*, ed. J. Rambaud-Buhot, Palma de Mallorca 1954, fasc. III, pp. 93-112: p. 96: «Dominus Papa et Cardinales faciant quod fiat unicus ordo de ordine Hospitalis Templi et Hospitalis Alemanorum, Fratrum de Doncles, de Calatrave, et iste ordo uocetur Ordo de Spiritu Sancto [...] Adhuc sit de predicto ordine unus magister in theologia qui habeat secum et de ordine suo viros sanctos et devotos qui addiscant diversas linguas in aliquo loco vel locis continue, scilicet arabicam linguam (*sic*), persescam, comanicam et guscam et alias linguas sismaticas. Isti sint scientes in theologia et philosophia, qui habeant etiam deuotionem mori propter Deum et predicare uerbum Dei per uniuersum mundum. Habeant etiam libros deputatos ad hoc, in quibus sint rationes necessarie ad destruendum omnes objectiones infidelium, per quas etiam fieri possint posiciones quas infideles destruere non possint, que quidem posiciones fieri possunt».

⁵⁷ ÉPHREM LONGPRÉ, *Le Liber de acquisitione...*, cit., p. 271: «Iterum quantum ad sapientiam, potestatem et caritatem, dico quod, posito quod ordo Templariorum destruat, quod bona eorum

the Order of the Temple. He stresses the importance of using their resources to finance the crusades in the Holy Land. Nevertheless, he doesn't at any point emphasize the charges that have been brought against them.

Therefore, in the article *Ramón Llull, ante la convocación del concilio de Vienne*, García Palou is able to affirm⁵⁹ that, on the one hand, the foundation of language schools is conceived by Llull as an instrument for evangelization. On the other hand, he views the unification of the military orders as a useful instrument for undertaking the crusade.

Learning foreign languages: *Miramar*

Now some words about the Lullian proposal of founding language schools.

In the literature about Llull's ideas on crusades, historians stress the important role the proposal of founding language schools plays in the Lullian missionary concept. In addition to arguing for the necessity of an armed crusade in the works he wrote after the fall of Acre, Llull also underlines the importance of learning foreign oriental languages. This conversion strategy of learning oriental languages is already a part of Llull's thought at the beginning of his literary production. Llull himself was able to speak Arabic; he was always with his Arab slave.⁶⁰

Already in the *Liber contemplationis*, which was written in the years 1273 to 1274, Llull considers intellectual dialogue the most important tool for proving the Christians' truths to the unbelievers. In this sense, he sees it as fundamental to learn the infidel's *idiomata*.⁶¹ This Lullian idea of founding language schools didn't re-

tradantur magistro generali, militi religioso supradicto, ut thesaurus Ecclesiae multiplicetur contra homines infideles, et hoc dignum et justum est quoniam ipsa bona incepta fuerunt et in actum deducta ad acquirendum Terram Sanctam et hoc sapientiam potestatem et caritatem attestatur et beatus Petrus in alia vita hoc recolit, intelligit et diligit».

⁵⁸ *Ibid.*: «Facta praedicta ordinatione, requiritur quod sit confirmata in generali concilio apud Viennam quod spectatur ab hoc septembri in unum annum [...]».

⁵⁹ S. GARCÍA PALOU, *Ramón Llull, ante la convocación del concilio de Vienne*, in «Estudios Franciscanos» 76 (1975), pp. 343-358: p. 353: «La fundación de colegios de lenguas orientales le interesaba como medio para la evangelización del mundo. La unificación de todas las órdenes militares existentes, como medio para la conquista de Tierra Santa».

⁶⁰ RAIMUNDUS LULLUS, *Vita coetanea*, cit., p. 278: «Emptoque sibi ibidem quodam Saraceno, linguam arabicam dicit (sic!) ab eodem».

⁶¹ *Id.*, *Liber Contemplationis*, MOG X (1724), p. 218: «Igitur, cum hoc ita sit, si Christiani (Domine) perfecte amarent nostram Dominam sanctam Mariam dignam amari amore perfecto, addiscerent idiomata infidelium et irent ad ipsos ut facerent eos memorare et intelligere nostram Dominam et virtutem et honorationem ipsius ut eam amarent: igitur, cum in populo Christianorum sint tot Religiosi apti ad addiscendum diversas linguas et ad probandum et demonstrandum infidelibus honorationes nostrae Dominae, et sanctus Pater Apostolicus et Cardinales adeo abundant bonis Ecclesiae de quibus possunt facere expensas [...]». *Ivi*, p. 486: «Rex Regum et Domine Dominorum! qui es amor meorum amorum. Qui vult juvare et consentire ad hoc, ut totus mundus convertatur ad sanctam Fidem Romanam, oportet, quod [...] sancti Religiosi, quos D. demonstrat esse in C, instruuntur in diversis linguis [...]».

main only an ideal in his writings – it was actually realized. In fact, upon request of Llull⁶² in the year 1276 King James II of Mallorca founded the monastery of Miramar⁶³ on Majorca, in which 13 Franciscan friars had to be educated in Arabic and in «other sciences» too. With a bull (*Laudanda tuorum*) dated October 17th, 1276, Pope John XXI confirmed the foundation of this school.

García Palou wrote an important monograph on the history of this monastery titled *El Miramar de Ramon Llull* (1977). In accordance not only with Palou but also with the Lullian oeuvre, it can be said that in Llull's thought the main means of a successful evangelisation are the learning of Arabic (and other foreign languages), knowledge of theology, philosophy, and the Holy Scriptures, and at least the apologetics of the necessary reasons (*necessariae rationes*), on which the whole Lullian system is based. Consequently, it would be unimaginable, as Palou says, for the friars in Miramar not to have been taught all three of these matters.⁶⁴ In the *Liber de passagio* (1292) Llull states of the soldiers in the Holy Land: «Habeant etiam libros deputatos ad hoc, in quibus sint rationes necessariae ad destruendum omnes obiectiones infidelium [...]».⁶⁵ They should not only learn the oriental languages but also dispute in accordance with the *rationes necessariae* in order to destroy the infidel's errors. In year 1295 in his *Desconort*, Llull laments the closing (1292) of the school in Miramar.⁶⁶ But despite his deep disappointment, he doesn't abandon his belief in the importance of language schools for the activity of conversion. We can find references to it in all his works. For example, in the *Disputatio fidei et intellectus* (1303) he calls for the Pope to create language chairs at the *studia generalia* in Montpellier, Toulouse, Paris, and Naples.⁶⁷ We can find other references

⁶² ID., *Vita Coetanea*, cit., p. 282: «Sub eodem tempore impetravit etiam Raimundus a praedicto rege Maioricarum unum monasterium construi in regno suo, et possessionibus dotari sufficientibus, ac in eodem tredecim fratres Minores institui, qui linguam ibidem discerent arabicam pro conuertendis infidelibus, ut superius est expressum». Llull also speaks about Miramar in chapter 65 of *Blaquerna* (Ramon Llull, *Romanç d'Evast e Blaquerna*, Edició crítica de A. Soler -J. Santanach, Palma 2009, p. 297).

⁶³ About Miramar: S. GARCÍA PALOU, *El Miramar de Ramon Llull*, Palma de Mallorca 1977.

⁶⁴ S. GARCÍA PALOU, *El Miramar de Ramon Llull*, cit., pp. 72-73: «La lengua árábica, los conocimientos de filosofía, teología y sagrada escritura, y, finalmente, la apologética de las razones necesarias eran, para Ramon Llull, los tres medios indispensables de que tenía que valerse el misionero entre los musulmanes, para su evangelización. [...] Per todo esos motivos, es inconcebible que, en Miramar, no se adiestrase a los 13 Frailes Menores en el manejo de esas armas intelectuales de cuya eficacia Ramon Llull se hallaba firmamente convencido».

⁶⁵ RAIMUNDUS LULLUS, *Liber de passagio*, cit., p. 329.

⁶⁶ ID., *Desconort*, ORL XIX (1936), p. 246: «E que cascú lenguatge fos mostrat, segons que a Miramar ha estat ordenat, e ajan conciencia qui ho ha afoilat!».

⁶⁷ ID., *Disputatio fidei et intellectus*, ROL XXIII (1998), ed. W. Euler, p. 279: «Et cum ipso ire per generalia studia demonstratum, uidelicet ad Montem Pessulanum, Tholosam, Parisius, Neapolim et ad alia studia uniuersa, ut determinetur, quis uestrum obtineat ueritatem. Volo etiam rogare reges, ut tractent, quod religiosi et alii in sacra pagina litterati ad prouidendum hoc, debeant laborare, et studia supradicta diuersorum idiomatum terrarum infidelium procurare, ut per ipsa studia infideles ad uiam sanctam ualeant peruenire».

to it in the *Liber de fine*⁶⁸ (1305), in the *Liber clericorum*⁶⁹ (1308), and in the *Disputatio Raymundi et Hamar Saraceni*⁷⁰ (1308).

The monastery in Miramar wasn't the first school for oriental languages. Already in the year 1250 there was a *studium arabicum et hebraicum* in Toledo. In the year 1254 there was an Arabic chair in Seville, which was recognized as *studium generale* by Alexander IV. In Barcelona a *studium hebraicum* was founded in the year 1281, whose director was Ramon Martí,⁷¹ author of the *Pugio fidei*. In Valencia a *studium arabicum* was established in the same year, whose director was Juan de Puigventós. Both of these schools were modelled on the Arabic and Jewish chairs of the school in Murcia,⁷² founded in the year 1263⁷³ by the General of the Dominican Order St. Raymond of Penyafort, who encouraged Ramon Llull to study the Arabic language. In the year 1291 the *studium hebraicum*⁷⁴ in Barcelona fused with the *studium arabicum* in Valencia to create a bilingual school in Játiva, which was probably gone by 1314. The history of the language schools seems, in any case, to begin with the school in Tunis in the year 1230 (probably closed in 1258),⁷⁵ where not only Raymond of Penyafort but also the Dominican friar Ramon Martí studied Arabic.

The purpose of all of these schools is more apologetic than grammatical and philological.⁷⁶ For example, in his *Litterae Encyclicae* from 1255, the Dominican Fr.

⁶⁸ ID., *Liber de fine*, cit., p. 250: «Et quia christiani ad hunc statum prauissimum et iniustum quasi remedium nolunt dare, idcirco quidam homo dimisit omnia, quae habebat, et diu per consequens laborauit, quasi per mundum eundo uniuersum, adeo ut posset protinus impetrare cum domino papa, dominis cardinalibus et etiam aliis principibus huius mundi remedium et iuuamen ad tale malum magnum et maxime inhonestum, si posset, penitus euitandum, procurans tali modo, quod dominus papa et domini cardinales et etiam alii principes supra dicti aliqua monasteria aedificari concederent et construi, in quibus aliqui ualentes homines litterati, pro Christo desiderantes mortem pati, diuersas linguas infidelium addicerent et audirent, ut per consequens per uniuersum mundum irent euangelium praedicatum, sicut praecepit noster Dominus Iesus Christus, qui dixit sancto Petro: Petre, si amas me, pasce oues meas».

⁶⁹ ID., *Liber clericorum*, ROL XXII (1998), ed. A. Madre, pp. 305-354, p. 354: «Primum est, quod fiant quattuor aut quinque monasteria, in quibus idiomata infidelium addiscantur semper. Et ibi sint sanctae et litteratae personae, quae mori desiderant propter Christum. Et uadant, sicut praeceptum est, per uniuersum mundum, omnibus hominibus euangelium praedicatum».

⁷⁰ ID., *Disputatio Raymundi et Hamar Saraceni*, ROL XXII (1998), ed. A. Madre, pp. 158-264; p. 263: «Tria supra dicta sunt haec, uidelicet quod dominus Papa et reuerendi cardinales facerent in perpetuum quattuor aut quinque monasteria, in quibus religiosi et saeculares litterati et deuoti, et feruentes mori propter Deum addiscerent idiomata infidelium. Et deinde irent ad praedicandum euangelia per uniuersum mundum, ut praeceptum est».

⁷¹ On the relationship between Ramón Martí and Ramon Llull, see: E. COLOMER, *Ramón Llull y Ramón Martí*, in «Estudios Lulianos» 28 (1988), pp. 1-37.

⁷² J. MA COLL, *Escuelas de lenguas orientales en los siglos XIII y XIV (Periodo postraymundiano)*, in «Analecta Sacra Tarraconensia» 18 (1945), pp. 59-87.

⁷³ The school seems to have been closed in the year 1275 when Raymond of Penyafort died.

⁷⁴ Arnau de Vilanova was a disciple of Ramón Martí in the Jewish language.

⁷⁵ J. MA COLL, *Escuelas de lenguas orientales en los siglos XIII y XIV (Periodo Raymundiano)*, in «Analecta Sacra Tarraconensia» 17 (1944), pp. 115-138.

⁷⁶ *Ivi*, p. 117: «Tenían estas Escuelas una finalidad más apologética que gramatical o filológica».

Humbert of Románs voices a favourable opinion of the study of the Arabic, Greek, and Hebrew languages for evangelizing the infidels. Thus, the school of Miramar was probably no different from the Dominican schools.

Conclusions

To conclude, it's clear that intellectual dialogue is considered by Llull the most important tool to convert the unbelievers. But, it can only really be successful if the participants in this dialogue study the language of the other party.

Though Llull seems to abandon the idea of an armed crusade at the end of his life, he never stops fighting for the creation of language schools and promoting inter-religious dialogue.

I like to finish with some considerations of P. May Beattie, which wrote her doctoral thesis with the title *Evangelization, Reform and Eschatology: Mission and Crusade in the Thought of Ramon Llull*, University of Toronto 1995 (pp. 113-115):

Moreover, although he called for crusade in the service of mission, his thought is more complex and subtle than this single idea can encompass. Llull's plans for crusade and mission were determined by theological and religious presuppositions which shaped his thought as a whole. Thus it is in the context of Llull's understanding of the purpose of mankind and his view of Christian society that we must look for further insight into the relationship mission and crusade.